

# Street Vendor Regulation Enforcement in Keputran Market Surabaya by Satpol PP

Edo Pandu Pratama<sup>1</sup>, Tukiman<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Universitas Pembangunan Nasional "Veteran" Jawa Timur

Email: [edopandu555@gmail.com](mailto:edopandu555@gmail.com)

**Abstract.** *Street Vendors (PKL) play a significant role in Indonesia's informal economy, although their presence often conflicts with the government regarding the use of public spaces. In cities like Surabaya, the government seeks to regulate PKL activities through local regulations enforced by the Municipal Police (Satpol PP), aiming to create a more orderly and cleaner urban environment. However, these efforts often face resistance from PKL, who feel their livelihoods are being threatened. This study aims to examine and describe the implementation of the policy for controlling street vendors by the Satpol PP of Tegalsari District in the Keputran Market area of Surabaya. The research employs a qualitative descriptive approach, with data collection techniques including observation, interviews, and documentation. Data analysis is conducted using an interactive analysis technique involving data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The results show that communication, resources, and bureaucratic structure indicators support the policy implementation, but the disposition indicator is not yet optimal due to the lack of full support from the implementers, thus requiring improvements to enhance policy effectiveness.*

**Keywords:** *Policy Implementation, Communication Dimension, Resource Dimension, Disposition Dimension, Bureaucratic Structure Dimension*

Received: October 2, 2024

Received in Revised: October, 23  
2024

Accepted: November, 15 2024

## INTRODUCTION

Economic development is one of the key pillars in Indonesia's national development efforts, as stated by Mandasari and Prabawati (2020). The market plays a central role in the economy, serving as a critical means of job creation (Lubis et al., 2024). Through trade activities, the exchange of goods and services is expected to stimulate economic growth and improve societal welfare. According to Regulation of the Minister of Trade Number 53 of 2008, a market is a place where buying and selling activities take place with more than one seller, including traditional markets and modern shopping centers (Saraswati & Wenagama, 2019). In Indonesia, traditional markets play an important role in economic growth and serve as trade hubs that reach all levels of society. Proper market management is essential to ensure smooth economic activities and to provide a safe and orderly environment for business operations (Djadjuli, 2018; Hatib, 2020).

Markets can be understood in three contexts: as a physical place, a platform for demand and supply interaction, and as a group of individuals with diverse needs and purchasing power (Safri, 2018). In Indonesia, traditional markets are deeply influenced by local cultural values, emphasizing politeness and respect in transactions. In 2022, there were 16,429 traditional markets recorded in Indonesia, an increase from the previous year. This growth was driven by government-led regulation and the construction of new markets by the central government. However, traditional markets continue to face competition from modern markets. Modern

markets, offering convenience and ease in transactions, are gradually shifting public preferences away from traditional markets. Traditional markets, which rely on bargaining systems and local resources, require transformation to enhance their competitiveness, such as through modernization and reorganization (Reardon & Timmer, 2007; Liu et al., 2022).

Street vendors (PKL), as part of the informal sector, also significantly contribute to the economy. They sell various goods, from food to retail items, with limited capital. PKL often operate in public spaces such as sidewalks and roads without official permits, leading to their being perceived as violating regulations (Hanafi & Amriyanto, 2023). Nevertheless, this informal sector is a characteristic of developing countries and cannot be eradicated without disrupting the economy. Therefore, policies regarding PKL must strike a balance between law enforcement and their needs. In large cities like Surabaya, PKL not only help reduce unemployment but also play a vital role in boosting urban economic activity. PKL are adaptable in adjusting to market demands and grassroots distribution, making them an essential part of the marketing chain (Hanum et al., 2024).

Being a PKL is a choice for individuals who lack specialized skills or formal education, except for those selling artisanal goods. PKL also offer affordable goods, making them a preferred option for the lower-middle class. However, their presence in urban areas often creates issues as they occupy public spaces intended for pedestrians or vehicles. This leads to conflicts over the use of public space and diminishes its functional value. The Keputran Market area in Surabaya is one of the locations frequently utilized by PKL, where they occupy sidewalks along Jalan Kayoon, Urip Sumoharjo, and Pandegiling to sell their goods. The economic growth and increasing population in Surabaya have led to a higher demand for goods and services, thus increasing the demand for PKL's services. However, the presence of PKL in the Keputran Market is often blamed for causing traffic congestion, especially in the mornings when trading activities peak.

To address this issue, the Surabaya City Government plans to regulate PKL in the Keputran Market area. This regulation aims to maintain order, cleanliness, and comfort in public spaces. The government has also provided new locations for PKL to continue selling in a more organized manner without disrupting public order. PD Pasar Surya, a government-owned enterprise responsible for managing traditional markets in Surabaya, is tasked with ensuring the safety and management of these markets, including Keputran Market. They collaborate with security forces to maintain a safe and orderly market environment. PD Pasar Surya also manages the allocation of spaces for vendors, including issuing permits and ensuring market regulations are followed.

Although the government has provided solutions for PKL, regulatory enforcement often faces resistance from vendors. PKL feel that government policies do not support their interests and threaten their livelihoods. This has been the case between the Surabaya government and PKL in the Keputran Market area, where regulatory enforcement has often met with resistance from the vendors. The Surabaya City Government has empowered the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) to handle PKL issues through Surabaya City Regulation Number 2 of 2020 on Public Order Management. Satpol PP is responsible for fostering and enforcing regulations related to PKL to ensure order in the Keputran Market area. However, this policy has not been fully effective due to the conflicting interests of the government and PKL. While Satpol PP aims to organize the area to maintain order, PKL seek to continue trading in strategic locations to retain their customer base.

This conflict highlights that Satpol PP has not yet been able to fully implement policies that align with the actual conditions on the ground in Surabaya. Existing regulations often reduce the public's right to use public spaces for activities. In this study, the implementation of PKL regulation policies in Keputran Market is analyzed using Edward III's policy implementation theory. According to this theory, the success of policy implementation is influenced by four factors: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The communication factor includes how information about the policy is conveyed to all parties involved. The resource

factor relates to the availability of funds, personnel, and other supporting facilities. Disposition refers to the attitudes of policy implementers, whether they support or hinder the implementation of the policy. Meanwhile, the bureaucratic structure involves standard operating procedures (SOPs) and hierarchies that support policy implementation. With this background, this study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of the implementation of PKL regulation policies in the Keputran Market area by Satpol PP, as well as the factors influencing it.

## **METHODS**

This study employs a qualitative approach. Yin (2015) explains that the qualitative approach utilizes data in the form of written or spoken words, or descriptive events. According to Gunawan (2022), the purpose of qualitative research is to describe social realities and perceptions relevant to the research. In this study, the researcher examines the implementation of the regulation policy for street vendors (PKL) in the Keputran Market, Surabaya, by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP). The research was conducted using a case study method, which allows the researcher to investigate the phenomenon in-depth and contextually. This study aims to describe natural occurrences resulting from human activities (Sukmadinata, 2008). The case study approach provides the opportunity to obtain more detailed and comprehensive information about the research subject. The researcher can control variables, conduct in-depth observations, and understand complex cases with a more focused approach.

The research was conducted at Keputran Market in Surabaya, particularly on Jalan Kayoon, Urip Sumoharjo, and Pandegiling, where PKL operate. These locations were chosen due to the increasing number of street vendors, which causes disruptions to pedestrian comfort and city management. The focus of the research is the performance of Satpol PP in regulating the PKL using George C. Edward III's policy implementation theory, which comprises four main factors: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Communication in policy implementation involves delivering clear and consistent information. Resources include the necessary information to implement the policy, including data related to the policy. Disposition refers to the attitudes of policy implementers, which can hinder implementation if there are differing perspectives from policymakers. Bureaucratic structure is essential for ensuring effective and efficient coordination in policy implementation.

Data collection in this research was carried out through interviews, documentation, and observation. The data obtained were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles and Huberman, which involves data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. The validity of the data was tested through credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability tests. The results of the analysis are expected to provide a comprehensive overview of the implementation of the street vendor regulation policy at Keputran Market, Surabaya, and the performance of Satpol PP in achieving the policy objectives.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Based on the research findings through observation, documentation, and interviews, the researcher emphasizes the importance of evaluating the policy on street vendor (PKL) regulation at Keputran Market by Satpol PP Surabaya. Policy implementation aims to ensure that public policies achieve their intended objectives. According to Mazmanian and Sabatier (as cited in Wahab, 2008), policies can be implemented directly through programs or through derivative policies. Public policies often require implementing regulations, such as Presidential Decrees or Ministerial Decrees. The evaluation of policy success is based on George C. Edward III's theory, which measures effectiveness through the indicators of communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure.

### **Communication Dimension**

Communication is one of the key factors in policy implementation, according to Edward III, encompassing three main dimensions: transmission of information, clarity of information, and consistency of information.

Transmission of information involves the Surabaya City Government, through Satpol PP, optimizing the implementation of Regional Regulation (Perda) No. 2 of 2020 on Public Order by disseminating the impacts of disorder. Socialization was conducted through print media (banners), electronic media (local television), and direct outreach. Although initially facing resistance from the community, who perceived street vendors (PKL) as economically beneficial, sustained socialization efforts successfully raised awareness of the importance of public order. The consistent transmission strategy through various communication channels demonstrates that effective communication can reduce initial resistance and help achieve policy goals.

Clarity of information in the policy is crucial for the public to understand its objectives and benefits. The regulation of PKL often encounters challenges due to social and economic factors that compel vendors to continue selling in prohibited areas. Therefore, the government must formulate policies clearly to avoid misunderstandings. In this regulation effort, the government ensured that the rules regarding vendor locations and arrangements were conveyed firmly, so that all parties involved had a shared understanding. Active community participation in this process is also expected to enhance the policy's success.

Consistency of information is essential to ensure that all involved parties understand and follow the policy directions. Frequent changes in directives can lead to confusion among policy implementers and the public. Satpol PP strives to maintain consistency in enforcement by involving the community, who play a role in ensuring law enforcement. This consistency is also important for building trust and cooperation between Satpol PP and the public, ensuring the objectives of regulation and public order are effectively achieved. Edwards III emphasizes the importance of clear and consistent communication in policy implementation to minimize misunderstandings and ensure the policy is well-received by the public. Clarity and consistency in policy directives also strengthen the government's credibility and increase public compliance with the implemented policies.

### **Resource Dimension**

Resources are a crucial element in the successful implementation of policies. Edwards III argues that a lack or imbalance of resources can hinder policy execution and obstruct the achievement of objectives. Therefore, proper resource management is essential to support the effective implementation of policies.

Satpol PP plays a central role in enforcing public order policies, specifically in regulating street vendors (PKL) in Surabaya. With a total of 783 personnel, including Civil Servants and Contract Workers, Satpol PP conducts structured enforcement operations. The Head of Operations directs Satpol PP platoons to oversee vendors in various locations. The technical procedures for enforcement are divided into three stages: preparation, execution, and evaluation. Preparation includes training and task allocation; execution involves direct supervision in the field, while evaluation assesses personnel performance and reports operation results. The study by Yudithia et al. (2024) supports Edwards III's theory that the success of policy implementation depends on effective utilization of human resources and a well-organized operational structure.

Adequate facilities and infrastructure are vital to support Satpol PP's duties. Good equipment and infrastructure enhance operational efficiency and effectiveness in the field. Person-Harm & Cooper (2014) asserts that proper maintenance and management of facilities are critical to ensuring the continuity of public institutions' operational functions. In the context of Satpol PP, well-maintained facilities ensure that enforcement operations proceed without technical obstacles. The operational success of Satpol PP in Surabaya demonstrates that effective management of facilities and infrastructure is key to maintaining the efficacy of law enforcement. The research by Sutanto & Wahyudi (2021) also shows that well-managed facilities improve the performance of public institutions.

Satpol PP is authorized to maintain public order, conduct enforcement, and impose nonjudicial sanctions on violators of regional regulations. Satpol PP has also introduced

innovations in its organizational structure by forming specialized teams with different task focuses. Teams such as Tim Pasopati and Tim Arimbi are responsible for rapid response, socialization, and enforcement against violators of regional regulations. Satpol PP's innovative approach in forming specialized teams reflects the strategic and focused use of resources. With good coordination between Satpol PP and relevant parties such as the TNI/POLRI, enforcement activities can run more smoothly. These innovations also help reduce conflicts with the public and ensure that law enforcement is carried out persuasively and humanely (Moore et al., 2004). The organizational structure adapted to field needs, such as Satpol PP's special teams, aligns with Edwards III's theory. An innovative structure and strategic use of resources enhance the effectiveness of policy implementation in Surabaya.

### **Disposition Dimension**

Disposition is the third element analyzed in this study, focusing on the attitudes and character of policy implementers. Implementers who possess honesty, commitment, and a democratic attitude are crucial in the execution of public policies. According to George Edward III (Matland, 1995), honesty enables implementers to accurately follow policy guidelines, while strong commitment helps them confront various challenges during policy implementation. Without strong disposition, policy implementation may fail to achieve its objectives. In the context of regulating street vendors (PKL) by Satpol PP in Surabaya, the attitude of policy implementers is critical. Satpol PP officers must perform their duties in accordance with Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), which include being humane, firm, and non-arrogant. Effective policy implementation requires a good disposition, which includes the readiness and sincerity of implementers in carrying out the policy (Sari & Kusumaningsih, 2024). A mismatched attitude from implementers can hinder policy execution and reduce the effectiveness of achieving its goals.

The right disposition from policy implementers allows the policy to be more easily accepted by the public. Honesty and commitment from implementers play a key role in the process of regulating PKL in Pasar Keputran. With the appropriate attitude, policies can be implemented consistently, and challenges encountered in the field can be overcome. In this study, the disposition of Satpol PP officers will be evaluated to assess how much they support the success of PKL regulation policies. The success of the policy greatly depends on the integrity and commitment of the implementers in ensuring that the policy proceeds as planned. Strong disposition from policy implementers is the key to achieving policy objectives. Without the right disposition, policies are likely to face many obstacles in the field. Therefore, it is crucial for implementers to have an attitude that supports the policy, adheres to established rules, and demonstrates high commitment in carrying out their duties.

George C. Edwards III's policy implementation theory mentions that disposition encompasses the attitudes, commitment, and motivation of implementers in executing policies. According to Edwards III, policy implementers who have a positive disposition and high integrity will be more successful in implementing policies, even when facing challenges in the field. Implementers with a good disposition tend to be more effective in building relationships with the public, making the policy more readily accepted and reducing public resistance. Hasbullah & Wangi (2021) research supports Edwards III's view that the disposition of implementers is a crucial factor in policy success. When implementers have the motivation and attitude that support the policy, they are better able to overcome challenges in the field and implement the policy effectively. A good disposition also improves public acceptance of the policy and reduces resistance. In the context of Satpol PP in Surabaya, a humane attitude and adherence to SOPs are crucial factors to ensure the smooth implementation of PKL regulation policies.

Satpol PP Surabaya demonstrates that a positive disposition can be applied through a persuasive and humane approach. This approach reflects Satpol PP's efforts to build a strong disposition in carrying out their enforcement tasks. Implementers with a positive attitude can significantly improve policy outcomes because they are more responsive, consistent, and



effective in performing their duties. In conclusion, a strong disposition is essential in the implementation of public policies. A good disposition not only influences the success of policy execution but also how the public receives and complies with the policy. Edwards III's theory emphasizes that ensuring every implementer has the right disposition is a top priority in achieving optimal policy outcomes. Implementers who have commitment, integrity, and a democratic attitude will be more capable of supporting policy execution and ensuring that the policy is carried out according to its intended objectives.

### **Bureaucratic Structure Dimension**

Managing order and organizing street vendors (PKL) requires a systematic approach with clear procedures. Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) are essential tools for organizations to outline the necessary steps to address issues in accordance with applicable regulations. The SOP implemented by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) refers to local regulations concerning the regulation and organization of PKL. This SOP ensures that every action taken aligns with established guidelines, thereby guaranteeing effective policy implementation. This study illustrates how the Satpol PP SOP is applied in the field and evaluates the extent to which the bureaucratic structure adheres to the procedures. This information is crucial for understanding the effectiveness and consistency of PKL regulation policies. With the existence of SOPs, the process of managing PKL order becomes more planned and standardized, ensuring that actions taken comply with existing laws. Evaluation of the SOP provides insights into the effectiveness of the procedures in addressing order issues and how the bureaucratic structure adapts to field situations.

In the context of PKL regulation, the Satpol PP SOP plays a vital role in maintaining the consistency of policy implementation. With clear SOPs, Satpol PP can effectively carry out PKL regulation in accordance with established guidelines. Research supports Edwards III's theory, which posits that a bureaucratic structure backed by good SOPs can enhance policy implementation effectiveness. SOPs ensure that all actions adhere to predetermined guidelines, maintaining consistency and accountability in the field. Overall, the SOPs applied by Satpol PP in regulating and organizing PKL reinforce the importance of a robust bureaucratic structure for successful policy implementation. SOPs help ensure that all actions are consistent with prevailing policies, thereby increasing effectiveness and success in addressing order issues in the field.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the analysis of policy implementation indicators, several aspects are functioning well, while others require improvement. The following explanations are provided:

Communication in the implementation of the regulation and organization of street vendors (PKL) by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) shows adequate results. Routine socialization has helped establish effective communication with the community. The information conveyed is clear and sufficient, enabling the public to better understand the objectives and procedures of the policy. This effective communication plays a crucial role in reducing community resistance and increasing compliance with regulations. With effective communication, Satpol PP has succeeded in fostering a deeper understanding of the policy, thereby facilitating smoother implementation.

The communication indicators also show positive results. Satpol PP possesses adequate personnel and facilities to support policy implementation. The balanced number of personnel with available resources allows Satpol PP to perform its duties more optimally. Sufficient resources support the regulation and monitoring process while maintaining order in the field. With the available resources, Satpol PP can carry out the regulation of PKL in accordance with established targets, thereby enhancing the effectiveness of policy implementation.

The bureaucratic structure in place operates effectively through the implementation of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and clear delegation of authority. The SOPs applied by Satpol PP provide detailed guidelines for each personnel in performing their tasks. Clear

delegation of authority also ensures that each unit understands its roles and responsibilities, which positively impacts coordination and efficiency in policy implementation. With structured SOPs, the potential for errors in policy implementation can be minimized, and every action taken is in accordance with the established procedures.

The disposition indicators reveal inadequate results. The attitudes and commitment of Satpol PP personnel do not fully support optimal policy implementation. At times, implementers do not demonstrate attitudes consistent with the required actions, indicating a lack of commitment to their duties. This weak disposition may hinder policy success, as uncommitted implementers are less likely to perform their tasks responsibly. To address this issue, there is a need to enhance the commitment and integrity of policy implementers to achieve the policy objectives optimally.

To improve the effectiveness of PKL regulation, periodic training is necessary to strengthen the disposition of Satpol PP personnel regarding commitment, integrity, empathy, and communication. Additionally, providing recognition and regularly evaluating attitudes, optimizing communication through interactive media and open forums to gather community feedback, enhancing resources through personnel and equipment needs assessments, utilizing monitoring technology for efficient task allocation, and reinforcing the bureaucratic structure through regular updates to SOPs and streamlining processes to expedite decision-making in the field are essential.

## REFERENCES

- Djadjuli, D. (2018). Peran pemerintah dalam pembangunan ekonomi daerah. *Dinamika: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 5(2), 8-21.
- Gunawan, I. (2022). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: teori dan praktik*. Bumi Aksara.
- Hanafi, M. A., & Amriyanto, A. (2023). Socialization of Legal Understanding Towards Street Merchants (PKL) who Provide Trading in Locations that are Prohibited from A Progressive Law Enforcement Perspective in Kupal Village District. South Halmahera. In *Proceeding International Conference Restructuring and Transforming Law* (pp. 382-388).
- Hanum, F., Yana, S., & Mauliza, P. (2024). *Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Pedagang Kaki Lima dalam Meningkatkan Perekonomian*. Mega Press Nusantara.
- Hasbullah, M. A., & Wangi, N. B. S. (2021). The Implementation Of Job Creation Law No. 11 2020 On The Ease Of Business:(The Analysis Of Opportunities And Threats Using The Edwards Iii Model Approach). *Media Mahardhika*, 20(1), 214-221.
- Hatib, A. (2020). *Manajemen Pengelolaan Pasar Cik Puan Kota Pekanbaru Dalam Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Pedagang Ditinjau Dari Perspektif Ekonomi Islam* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau).
- Liu, Y., Dai, L., Long, H., Woods, M., & Fois, F. (2022). Rural vitalization promoted by industrial transformation under globalization: The case of Tengtou village in China. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 95, 241-255.
- Lubis, P. K. D., Silalahi, H. H. B., Sinaga, A. F., Sapma, P. N., & Sitio, V. (2024). Pasar Modal Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Perekonomian Di Indonesia. *JAKA (Jurnal Akuntansi, Keuangan, dan Auditing)*, 5(1), 196-214.
- Mandasari, O. P., & Prabawati, I. (2020). Implementasi Kebijakan Pengembangan Kawasan Agropolitan di Desa Wedi Kecamatan Kapas Kabupaten Bojonegoro. *Publika*, 8(4).
- Matland, R. E. (1995). Synthesizing the implementation literature: The ambiguity-conflict model of policy implementation. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 5(2), 145-174.

- Moore, M. H., Judge, M. P., Martinez, C. J., & Noisette, L. (2004). The best defense is no offense: Preventing crime through effective public defense. *NYU Rev. L. & Soc. Change*, 29, 57.
- Person-Harm, A., & Cooper, J. (2014). *The care and keeping of cultural facilities: a best practice guidebook for museum facility management*. Rowman & Littlefield.
- Reardon, T., & Timmer, C. P. (2007). Transformation of markets for agricultural output in developing countries since 1950: How has thinking changed?. *Handbook of agricultural economics*, 3, 2807-2855.
- Safri, H. (2018). Pengantar ilmu ekonomi. *Palopo: Lembaga Penerbit Kampus IAIN Palopo*.
- Saraswati, M. D., & Wenagama, I. W. (2019). Analisis beberapa faktor yang mempengaruhi perubahan perilaku konsumen dari pasar tradisional ke pasar modern. *E-Jurnal Ekonomi Pembangunan Universitas Udayana*, 8(8), 1824-1852.
- Sari, G. H., & Kusumaningsih, O. (2024). Implementation Of E-Government Policy On The Application Of Banyumas Licensing Service Information System (Sipanjimas) At The Public Service Mall Of Banyumas Regency. *Dynamics: Journal of Public Administration*, 2(2), 59-76.
- Sukmadinata, N. S. (2008). Muhammad Syahrur: Limitasi Hukum Pidana Islam.
- Sukmadinata. (2008). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Wahyudi, A. H., & Sutanto, M. R. (2021). Pengembangan Karakter Ikari Shinji Dalam Anime Neo Genesis Evangelion. *Jurnal SAKURA: Sastra, Bahasa, Kebudayaan Dan Pranata Jepang*, 3(2), 144.
- Yin, R. K. (2015). *Studi Kasus: Desain & Metode (Ed. 1, Cet. 14 ed.)*. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Yudithia, Y., Akhyary, E., Alfiandri, A., Kurnianingsih, F., Samin, R., Subiyakto, R., ... & Yafi, E. (2024). Policy Implementation Process in the Management of Tanjungpinang City Waste Bank to Realize the Blue Economy. In *BIO Web of Conferences* (Vol. 134, p. 04008). EDP Sciences.